

**Freshwater Trout Aquaculture Dialogue  
Outreach Meetings in Turkey  
March 29-31, 2010**

**Meeting Summary**

**Prepared by World Wildlife Fund and LIMAN  
Christoph Mathiesen - [C.mathiesen@wwf.dk](mailto:C.mathiesen@wwf.dk)  
H.Yavuz Papila – [pakon@superonline.com](mailto:pakon@superonline.com)**

World Wildlife Fund - US  
1250 24<sup>TH</sup> St., NW  
Washington, DC 20037  
[www.worldwildlife.org](http://www.worldwildlife.org)

### **Meeting Background**

To advance the development of standards for responsible freshwater trout production, several members of the Freshwater Trout Aquaculture Dialogue (FTAD) Steering Committee and the FTAD coordinator met with representatives from the Turkish trout industry, government agencies, NGOs and the International Labor Organization. The meetings took place March 29-31, 2010 in Fethiye, Ankara and Istanbul Turkey.

The expected outcomes of the meetings were to:

- Increase awareness in Turkey about the FTAD
- Encourage participation in the FTAD process and adoption/support of the final FTAD standards
- Receive input about how to make the FTAD standards valuable and effective, especially within Turkey
- Give FTAD Steering Committee members a better understanding of the environmental and social issues the Turkish aquaculture sector faces

The decision to conduct FTAD outreach in Turkey was made by the FTAD Steering Committee in 2009 because Turkey is a world leader in commercial freshwater trout production and represents a broad variety of producers and production systems. Prior to the outreach meeting in Turkey, similar meetings were held in Spain, Italy, Denmark, France and Poland . The FTAD will continue to do outreach in important trout producing regions, such as Iran, Russia, UK and the United States. This outreach may be done via phone, in-person meetings or email correspondence with key stakeholders. The ongoing outreach to the global trout community is essential to the credibility, transparency and robustness of the FTAD.

### **Participants**

#### **Turkish trout industry (72 people):**

- Fish farmers from all sizes of farms and engaged in either the export and/or domestic markets
- Processors
- Feed producers

#### **Turkish ministry officials (18 people):**

- Ministry of Agriculture
- Ministry of Environment

#### **NGOs and ILO (6 people):**

- ILO: Gülay Aslantepe
- Dogadernegi: Ferdi Akarsu, among others
- WWF Turkey: Ayse Oruc and Ayca Aksoy, among others

**FTAD Steering Committee Members (2 people):**

Yavuz Pabila - LIMAN

Merrielle Macloed – World Wildlife Fund (WWF) US

**FTAD Coordinator (1 person):**

Christoph Mathiesen – WWF Denmark

**Key Outcomes**

Following is a summary of the key outcomes from each of the outreach meetings held in Turkey, as well as the main questions and concerns raised at the meetings.

**Meeting with the trout industry in Mugla, Fethiye – 29 March, 2010**

The meeting with the industry was set up as an informational meeting about the the Aquaculture Dialogues, FTAD and Aquaculture Stewardship Council (ASC). The meeting was seen as an opportunity for the FTAD Steering Committee to 1.) Recieve input on the current aquaculture-related developments in Turkey and 2.) Gain a better understanding of how the industry views the FTAD and challenges aorund sustainability, traceability and certification.

*General issues*

- It seems that the fish farms will be put into a new formation that is in accordance with the standarts. How will existing farms be influenced by the the standards?

*Standards, enforcement, legislation and state management*

- Will our government respect the Dialogue standards? How will the Dialogue standards fit in with standards imposed by the government?
- There are a lot of standards and laws being implemented. Why should we be choked with more bureaucracy?
- Will the Ministry of Agriculture respect the ASC certification scheme, given that the ministry typically does not respect non-Turkish government certificates? Is it necessary to have external official sanction in case of violation of the standarts?
- If the FTAD standards are not required by law, how will it be possible to control against corruption or misuse of standards?

*Economy*

- Could trout producers risk having big losses with ASC certification, as has been the case with other certification schemes?
- If the certification will require membership of labour unions the trout industry will suffer.

### *FTAD process and ASC*

- Will the final FTAD standards be different than the regulations we are following now?
- Will WWF help farmers financially or should they cover all certification-related expenses themselves?
- How are the countries chosen for the FTAD outreach meetings?
- Can everybody come to the FTAD Full Dialogue meeting in Italy in September?
- How are the members of the FTAD Steering Committee assigned?
- How are farmers from other countries responding to the FTAD standards?
- Will the FTAD standards also be viable in Europe?
- Are European retailers asking for ASC certification?
- Will the ASC have similar initiatives for tuna, sea bream and seabass?

### *Environment*

- We have problems with more than one farm tapping from the same water source (river). As the water reaches the last farm on the stream the water has already been used more than 25–30 times.
- We can solve all the other issues but the use of water is an issue far beyond our control.
- How can we decrease nitrate levels in the discharge water?

### **Meeting with the ministry officials in Ankara – 30 March, 2010**

The meetings with the ministries of Agriculture and Environment were also set up as informational meetings about the the Aquaculture Dialogues, FTAD and the ASC. Officials in the ministries working directly or indirectly with aquaculture and certification participated actively in the meetings and raised questions and concerns relevant to the FTAD and the impacts from aquaculture in Turkey, including:

- Will the FTAD standards be applicable to small-scale producers?
- How will these standards be different from the United Nations Food and Agriculture Organization's framework on responsible aquaculture?
- What will it cost to be certified?
- The Ministry of Agriculture explained that the FTAD can fit well with already existing activities in Turkey on sustainable aquaculture planning.
- It was suggested by the Ministry of Agriculture that the standards should include a measure for the ecological footprint just as there might be a measure for the carbon dioxide footprint.

- Ministry representatives expressed interest in being involved in the FTAD process, including the public comment periods later in 2010. The Ministry of Agriculture offered to give the FTAD Steering Committee members access to relevant documents, including ongoing research on the cage production of trout.
- The Ministry of Environment explained the key environmental concerns in Turkish aquaculture (e.g., feed, water use, chemicals, nutrients and effluents) and the challenges that governmental managers are faced with in planning the development in one of the world's fastest growing aquaculture sectors.

### **Meeting with the NGO community and ILO in Ankara and Istanbul – 30 and 31 March, 2010**

The meetings with the NGO community and ILO included informal discussions on the environmental and social issues related to Turkey's aquaculture sector and other related sectors. Questions were raised regarding the draft FTAD indicators. The importance of making the standards applicable to Turkey's aquaculture industry was emphasized.

The NGO community committed to participate in the public comment period for the FTAD draft standards and to assist the FTAD Steering Committee in reaching out to interested parties in Turkey.

### **Next Steps**

The FTAD Steering Committee will use the input from the outreach meetings in Turkey to refine the draft FTAD standards between now and when the first public comment period for the draft standards begins, which is expected to be by July 2010. The first public comment period will last for 60 days and will be a time when anybody, including trout farming stakeholders from Turkey, will be encouraged to give input and feedback to the first draft of the FTAD standards. The FTAD draft standards document will be posted in four languages, including Turkish, during the comment period. The FTAD Steering Committee will revise the draft standards based on feedback received and will release a new version for public comment by early October. Final standards are expected by the end of 2010.

The next international full public FTAD meeting is planned for early September in Italy. It will be open to anybody who wants to attend.